



[4910-EX-P]

**DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION**

**Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration**

[Docket No. FMCSA-2019-0015]

**Qualification of Drivers; Exemption Applications; Vision**

**AGENCY:** Federal Motor Carrier Safety Administration (FMCSA), DOT.

**ACTION:** Notice of applications for exemption; request for comments.

**SUMMARY:** FMCSA announces receipt of applications from 15 individuals for an exemption from the vision requirement in the Federal Motor Carrier Safety Regulations (FMCSRs) to operate a commercial motor vehicle (CMV) in interstate commerce. If granted, the exemptions will enable these individuals to operate CMVs in interstate commerce without meeting the vision requirement in one eye.

**DATES:** Comments must be received on or before [INSERT DATE 30 DAYS AFTER DATE OF PUBLICATION IN THE FEDERAL REGISTER].

**ADDRESSES:** You may submit comments identified by the Federal Docket Management System (FDMS) Docket No. FMCSA-2019-0015 using any of the following methods:

- **Federal eRulemaking Portal:** Go to <http://www.regulations.gov/docket?D=FMCSA-2019-0015>. Follow the online instructions for submitting comments.
- **Mail:** Docket Management Facility; U.S. Department of Transportation, 1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE, West Building Ground Floor, Room W12-140, Washington, DC 20590-0001.

- Hand Delivery: West Building Ground Floor, Room W12-140, 1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE, Washington, DC, between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., ET, Monday through Friday, except Federal Holidays.
- Fax: (202) 493-2251.

To avoid duplication, please use only one of these four methods. See the “Public Participation” portion of the SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION section for instructions on submitting comments.

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT:** Ms. Christine A. Hydock, Chief, Medical Programs Division, (202) 366-4001, fmcsamedical@dot.gov, FMCSA, Department of Transportation, 1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE, Room W64-224, Washington, DC 20590-0001. Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 5 p.m., ET, Monday through Friday, except Federal holidays. If you have questions regarding viewing or submitting material to the docket, contact Docket Services, (202) 366-9826.

**SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:**

**I. Public Participation**

**A. Submitting Comments**

If you submit a comment, please include the docket number for this notice (Docket No. FMCSA-2019-0015), indicate the specific section of this document to which each comment applies, and provide a reason for each suggestion or recommendation. You may submit your comments and material online or by fax, mail, or hand delivery, but please use only one of these means. FMCSA recommends that you include your name and a mailing address, an email address, or a phone number in the body of your document so that FMCSA can contact you if there are questions regarding your submission.

To submit your comment online, go to

<http://www.regulations.gov/docket?D=FMCSA-2019-0015>. Click on the “Comment Now!” button and type your comment into the text box on the following screen. Choose whether you are submitting your comment as an individual or on behalf of a third party and then submit.

If you submit your comments by mail or hand delivery, submit them in an unbound format, no larger than 8½ by 11 inches, suitable for copying and electronic filing. If you submit comments by mail and would like to know that they reached the facility, please enclose a stamped, self-addressed postcard or envelope.

FMCSA will consider all comments and material received during the comment period.

#### **B. Viewing Documents and Comments**

To view comments, as well as any documents mentioned in this notice as being available in the docket, go to <http://www.regulations.gov/docket?D=FMCSA-2019-0015> and choose the document to review. If you do not have access to the internet, you may view the docket online by visiting the Docket Management Facility in Room W12-140 on the ground floor of the DOT West Building, 1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE, Washington, DC 20590, between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., ET, Monday through Friday, except Federal holidays.

#### **C. Privacy Act**

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. 553(c), DOT solicits comments from the public to better inform its rulemaking process. DOT posts these comments, without edit, including any personal information the commenter provides, to [www.regulations.gov](http://www.regulations.gov), as described in the system of records notice (DOT/ALL-14 FDMS), which can be reviewed at [www.dot.gov/privacy](http://www.dot.gov/privacy).

## **II. Background**

Under 49 U.S.C. 31136(e) and 31315(b), FMCSA may grant an exemption from the FMCSRs for no longer than a 5-year period if it finds such exemption would likely achieve a level of safety that is equivalent to, or greater than, the level that would be achieved absent such exemption. The statute also allows the Agency to renew exemptions at the end of the 5-year period. FMCSA grants medical exemptions from the FMCSRs for a 2-year period to align with the maximum duration of a driver's medical certification.

The 15 individuals listed in this notice have requested an exemption from the vision requirement in 49 CFR 391.41(b)(10). Accordingly, the Agency will evaluate the qualifications of each applicant to determine whether granting an exemption will achieve the required level of safety mandated by statute.

The physical qualification standard for drivers regarding vision found in §391.41(b)(10) states that a person is physically qualified to drive a CMV if that person has distant visual acuity of at least 20/40 (Snellen) in each eye without corrective lenses or visual acuity separately corrected to 20/40 (Snellen) or better with corrective lenses, distant binocular acuity of at least 20/40 (Snellen) in both eyes with or without corrective lenses, field of vision of at least 70° in the horizontal Meridian in each eye, and the ability to recognize the colors of traffic signals and devices showing standard red, green, and amber.

On July 16, 1992, the Agency first published the criteria for the Vision Waiver Program, which listed the conditions and reporting standards that CMV drivers approved for participation would need to meet (57 FR 31458). The current Vision Exemption Program was established in 1998, following the enactment of amendments to the statutes governing exemptions made by § 4007 of the Transportation Equity Act for the 21st Century (TEA-21),

Public Law 105-178, 112 Stat. 107, 401 (June 9, 1998). Vision exemptions are considered under the procedures established in 49 CFR part 381 subpart C, on a case-by-case basis upon application by CMV drivers who do not meet the vision standards of § 391.41(b)(10).

To qualify for an exemption from the vision requirement, FMCSA requires a person to present verifiable evidence that he/she has driven a commercial vehicle safely in intrastate commerce with the vision deficiency for the past three years. Recent driving performance is especially important in evaluating future safety, according to several research studies designed to correlate past and future driving performance. Results of these studies support the principle that the best predictor of future performance by a driver is his/her past record of crashes and traffic violations. Copies of the studies may be found at <https://www.regulations.gov/docket?D=FMCSA-1998-3637>.

FMCSA believes it can properly apply the principle to monocular drivers, because data from the Federal Highway Administration's (FHWA) former waiver study program clearly demonstrated the driving performance of experienced monocular drivers in the program is better than that of all CMV drivers collectively.<sup>1</sup> The fact that experienced monocular drivers demonstrated safe driving records in the waiver program supports a conclusion that other monocular drivers, meeting the same qualifying conditions as those required by the waiver program, are also likely to have adapted to their vision deficiency and will continue to operate safely.

The first major research correlating past and future performance was done in England by Greenwood and Yule in 1920. Subsequent studies, building on that model, concluded that crash rates for the same individual exposed to certain risks for two different time periods vary

---

<sup>1</sup> A thorough discussion of this issue may be found in a FHWA final rule published in the *Federal Register* on March 26, 1996 and available on the internet at <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/FR-1996-03-26/pdf/96-7226.pdf>.

only slightly (See Bates and Neyman, University of California Publications in Statistics, April 1952). Other studies demonstrated theories of predicting crash proneness from crash history coupled with other factors. These factors – such as age, sex, geographic location, mileage driven and conviction history – are used every day by insurance companies and motor vehicle bureaus to predict the probability of an individual experiencing future crashes (See Weber, Donald C., “Accident Rate Potential: An Application of Multiple Regression Analysis of a Poisson Process,” Journal of American Statistical Association, June 1971). A 1964 California Driver Record Study prepared by the California Department of Motor Vehicles concluded that the best overall crash predictor for both concurrent and nonconcurrent events is the number of single convictions. This study used three consecutive years of data, comparing the experiences of drivers in the first two years with their experiences in the final year.

### **III. Qualifications of Applicants**

*David E. Bryant, Jr.*

Mr. Bryant, has a macular scar in the right eye due to sarcoidosis in 1993. The visual acuity in his right eye is hand motion, and in his left eye, 20/20. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, “In my medical opinion, Mr. Bryant has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Bryant reported that he has driven straight trucks for 30 years, accumulating 750,000 miles, tractor-trailer combinations for 25 years, accumulating 1.5 million miles, and buses for 30 years, accumulating 90,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from North Carolina. His driving record for the last three years shows two crashes, for which he was not cited, and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Zackary C. Crichton*

Mr. Crichton, 31, has retinopathy in his right eye due to toxoplasmosis in childhood. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/400, and in his left eye, 20/20. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, “Zachary [sic] has had this condition since he was 12. At this time in my medical opinion, I do believe Zachary [sic] can safely operate a commercial vehicle as he has for many years with this condition.” Mr. Crichton reported that he has driven straight trucks for six years, accumulating 150,000 miles, and tractor-trailer combinations for six years, accumulating 300,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Wyoming. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Terence P. Dailey*

Mr. Dailey, 63, has corneal scars in his left eye due to a traumatic incident in childhood. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, counting fingers. Following an examination in 2019, his ophthalmologist stated, “According to my medical opinion based on his August 12, 2019 dilated comprehensive eye examination, he is capable of operating a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Dailey reported that he has driven straight trucks for 49 years, accumulating 1.2 million miles, and tractor-trailer combinations for five years, accumulating 75,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Florida. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Robert K. Eggleston*

Mr. Eggleston, 31, has had amblyopia in the left eye since birth. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, 20/400. Following an examination in 2019, his ophthalmologist stated, “In my opinion this patient has sufficient vision to perform all driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Eggleston reported that he has driven

straight trucks for six years, accumulating 249,000 miles, and tractor-trailer combinations for one year, accumulating 1,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Ohio. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Luiz Gonzalez*

Mr. Gonzalez, 33, has had amblyopia in his right eye since birth. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/400, and in his left eye, 20/20. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "He has lived his entire life with his vision exactly the way it is now and poses no threat while driving a commercial vehicle." Mr. Gonzalez reported that he has driven straight trucks for five years, accumulating 130,000 miles. He holds an operator's license from New Jersey. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Ahmed M. Gutale*

Mr. Gutale, 46, has a prosthetic in his left eye due to a traumatic incident in 2004. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, no light perception. Following an examination in 2019, his ophthalmologist stated, "I certify that in my opinion he has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle." Mr. Gutale reported that he has driven tractor-trailer combinations for 19 years, accumulating 1.5 million miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Minnesota. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*James W. Harris*

Mr. Harris, 68, has had a paracentral scotoma in his right eye since birth. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/150, and in his left eye, 20/30. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "Due to the long standing nature of his vision deficiency and driving

record, I feel he has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Harris reported that he has driven tractor-trailer combinations for 50 years, accumulating 1.6 million miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Texas. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Dobbin L. Kirkbride*

Mr. Kirkbride, 54, has a cataract in his left eye due to a traumatic incident in 2011. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, light perception. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, “After an in-depth conversation with Mr. Kirkbride...it is my opinion that he has sufficient vision to operate a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Kirkbride reported that he has driven straight trucks for ten years, accumulating 520,000 miles, and tractor-trailer combinations for 33 years, accumulating 2.6 million miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Ohio. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Daniel F. Large*

Mr. Large, 40, has a retinal detachment in his right eye due to a traumatic incident in 2007. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/200, and in his left eye, 20/15. Following an examination in 2019, his ophthalmologist stated, “In summary, I believe Mr. Large has sufficient vision to perform his tasks of operating a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Large reported that he has driven straight trucks for 12 years, accumulating 132,000 miles, and tractor-trailer combinations for 12 years, accumulating 168,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Missouri. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Jonathan D. Matlasz*

Mr. Matlasz, 44, has had lenticonus in his right eye since birth. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/100, and in his left eye, 20/20. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "He has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle." Mr. Matlasz reported that he has driven straight trucks for eight years, accumulating 120,000 miles. He holds a Class B CDL from Connecticut. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*James Muldoon*

Mr. Muldoon, 57, has a cataract in his left eye due to a traumatic incident in 1966. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, hand motion. Following an examination in 2019, his ophthalmologist stated, "Based of records I have seen from 2011 he has no interval changes in his vision and his commercial license status should not be changed, as in my opinion he has sufficient vision to drive a commercial vehicle." Mr. Muldoon reported that he has driven tractor-trailer combinations for 13 years, accumulating 1.17 million miles. He holds a Class AM CDL from New York. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*Andrew R. Peel*

Mr. Peel, 44, has a retinal detachment in his left eye due to a traumatic incident in childhood. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, 20/400. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "In my opinion, Andrew has sufficient vision to operate a commercial vehicle, as he has been doing this for the past 20 years, as long as he is wearing his glasses prescription and has appropriate mirrors for a commercial vehicle." Mr. Peel reported that he has driven straight trucks for 17 years, accumulating 391,000 miles, and

tractor-trailer combinations for 17 years, accumulating 459,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Montana. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*William D. Shelt*

Mr. Shelt, 43, has had amblyopia in his left eye since birth. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, 20/100. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "Patient has sufficient vision to operate a commercial vehicle." Mr. Shelt reported that he has driven straight trucks for 20 years, accumulating 600,000 miles. He holds an operator's license from Alabama. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*James L. Stacy*

Mr. Stacy, 53, has a macular hole in his right eye due to a traumatic incident in 2008. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/200, and in his left eye, 20/20. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "Due to Mr. Stacy's intact visual fields and 20/20 O.U. acuity at distance and near, I believe Mr. Stacy has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to operate a commercial vehicle." Mr. Stacy reported that he has driven tractor-trailer combinations for ten years, accumulating 500,000 miles. He holds a Class A CDL from Arkansas. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

*James J. Walsh*

Mr. Walsh, 42, has had amblyopia in his left eye since childhood. The visual acuity in his right eye is 20/20, and in his left eye, 20/60. Following an examination in 2019, his optometrist stated, "I do feel he has sufficient vision to perform the driving tasks required to

operate a commercial vehicle.” Mr. Walsh reported that he has driven straight trucks for 21 years, accumulating 850,000 miles. He holds a Class B CDL from New Hampshire. His driving record for the last three years shows no crashes and no convictions for moving violations in a CMV.

#### **IV. Request for Comments**

In accordance with 49 U.S.C. 31136(e) and 31315(b), FMCSA requests public comment from all interested persons on the exemption petitions described in this notice. We will consider all comments and material received before the close of business on the closing date indicated under the DATES section of the notice.

Issued on: September 25, 2019.

**Larry W. Minor,**

*Associate Administrator for Policy.*

[FR Doc. 2019-21285 Filed: 9/30/2019 8:45 am; Publication Date: 10/1/2019]